BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 09564228 6

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

Comparative Law Theory

Course Materials

Professor Valcke

Faculty of Law, University of Toronto

Fall 2013

K
558
.V35
2013a
c.1

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

SEP - 5 2013

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

Comparative Law Theory

Course Materials

Professor Valcke

Faculty of Law, University of Toronto

Fall 2013

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/comparativelawth00valc_2

Comparative Law Theory

Professor Valcke
Fall 2013

I. Different Kinds of Comparative Law Scholarship

Stefan Vogenauer, "Sources of Law and Legal Method in Comparative Law" in Mathias Reimann and Reinhard Zimmermann, *The Oxford Handbook of Comparative Law* 869 (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008) at 875-876.....1

Colleen M. Flood, *International Health Care Reform* (London: Routledge, 2000) at 9, 11, 103-109.....3

George P. Fletcher, *The Grammar of Criminal Law* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2007) at 19-20, 68, 221-224, 340-342.....7

Rosemary J. Coombe, "The Cultural Life of Things: Anthropological Approaches to Law and Society in Conditions of Globalization" 10 Am. J. Int'l L. & Pol'y 791 (1995) at 796-797, 812-818.....14

James Gordley, ed., *The Enforceability of Promises in European Contract Law* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001) at 267-278.....23

Tom Ginsburg, "Studying Japanese Law Because It's There" 58 Am. J. Comp. L. 15 (2010) at 15-16, 23-5.....30

Questions I.....35

II. The "Malaise" of Comparative Law

William Ewald, "Comparative Jurisprudence (I): What Was It Like to Try a Rat?" (1994-95) 143 U. Pa. L. Rev. at 1961-1965.....36

Note.....41

Alan Watson, *Legal Transplants: An Approach to Comparative Law*, 2nd ed. (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1974) at 10-3.....42

Günter Frankenberg, "Critical Comparisons: Re-thinking Comparative Law" 26 Harv. Int'l. L. J. 411 (1985) at 416-426.....44

Gary King et al, *Designing Social Inquiry—Scientific Inference in Qualitative Research* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1994) at 3-12.....55

Questions II.....65

III. Different Models for Comparative Law as a self-standing academic discipline

A. Legal Transplants and Legal Formants

Alan Watson, *Legal Transplants: An Approach to Comparative Law*, 2nd ed. (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1974) at 1-9, 21-24, 27-30, 65-70.....66

P. Legrand, "The Impossibility of 'Legal Transplants'" 4 Maastricht Journal of European and Comparative Law 111 (1997).....80

Rodolfo Sacco, "Legal Formants: A Dynamic Approach to Comparative Law (Installment I of II)" 39 Am. J. Comp. L. 1 (1991) at 21-26.....88

Rodolfo Sacco, "Legal Formants: A Dynamic Approach to Comparative Law (Installment II of II)" 39 Am. J. L. 343 (1991) at 384-388.....95

Questions IIIA.....100

B. Functionalism

Konrad Zweigert and Heinz Kötz, *An Introduction to Comparative Law*, 3rd ed., vol. 1 (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998) at 28-45.....101

Geoffrey Samuel, "Epistemology and Comparative Law: Contributions from the Sciences and Social Sciences" in Mark van Hoecke, ed., *Epistemology and Methodology of Comparative Law* (Portland: Hart Publishing, 2004) at 38-43.....110

Jaako Husa, "Farewell to Functionalism of Methodological Tolerance?" 67 RabelsZ 419 (2003) at 421-22, 423-434.....113

Questions IIIB.....121

C. Comparative Jurisprudence and Legal Families

Konrad Zweigert and Heinz Kötz, *An Introduction to Comparative Law*, 3rd ed., vol. 1 (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998) at 63-67.....122

William Ewald, "Comparative Jurisprudence (I): What Was It Like to Try a Rat?" (1994-95) 143 U. Pa. L. Rev. at 1889-1898, 1943-1961, 2104-2149.....125

Questions IIIC.....179

IV. Theoretical Dimensions of Comparative Law as a self-standing academic discipline

A. The Internal Standpoint

Collingwood, in Gardiner, at 24-27.....180

Kerchove and Ost, *Legal System between Order and Disorder* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1994) at 1-2, 5-28, 102-112, 116-120, 122-146, 170-176.....182

William Ewald, "The Jurisprudential Approach to Comparative Law: A Field Guide to 'Rats'" (1998) 46:4 Am. J. Comp. L. at 701-704.....221

Pierre Legrand, "European Legal Systems Are Not Converging" (1996) 45:1 Int'l. & Comp. L. Q. at 52-81.....225

Ronald Dworkin, *Law's Empire* (Harvard University Press, 1986) at 12-15, 62-64.....241

Questions IVA.....245

B. Epistemological Issues

Rodolfo Sacco, "Legal Formants: A Dynamic Approach to Comparative Law (Installment I of II)" 39 Am. J. Comp. L. 1 (1991) at 10-11.....246

James Q. Whitman, "The neo-Romantic turn" in *Comparative LegalSTudies: Traditions and Transitions* (Cambridge: Cambridge Books Online, 2009) at 312-344.....248

Mitchel de S.-O.-l'E. Lasser, "The Question of Understanding" in Pierre Legrand and Roderick Miunday, eds., *Comparative Legal Studies: Traditions and Transitions* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003) at 197-239.....281

Jan M. Smits, "Legal Cultures Within the European Union: Pluralism" in *Private Law and Cultures of Eruopre* at 144-145.....295

Pierre Legrand, "Comparative Legal Studies and Commitment to Theory" 58 Mod. L. Rev. 262 (1995) at 266-267.....297

Pierre Legrand, "Comparing in Circles", Preface to Pip Nicholson and Sarah Biddulph, *Examining Practice, Interrogating Theory: Comparative Legal Studies in Asia* (Leiden: Brill) (excerpts).....299

Ronald Dworkin, *Law's Empire* (Harvard University Press, 1986), note 15 at 422-423.....303

Questions IVB.....304

C. Law as Diverse yet Unified—Legal Diversity (Many "Legal Systems")

Catherine Valcke, "Comparative Law as Comparative Jurisprudence—The Comparability of Legal Systems" (2004) 52 Am. J. Comp. L. at 720-721.....305

William Ewald, "Comparative Jurisprudence (I): What Was It Like to Try a Rat?" (1994-95) 143 U. Pa. L. Rev. at 1957-1958.....307

James Gordley, "The Universalist Heritage" in Pierre Legrand and Roderick Munday, eds., *Comparative Legal Studies: Traditions and Transitions* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003) at 31-45.....309

Questions IVC.....317

D. Law as Diverse yet Unified—Legal Unity (Common Features of Legal Systems)

Lon L. Fuller, *The Morality of Law* (New Haven: Yale Univ. Press, 1969) at 3-4, 33-41, 95-96....318

Ernest J. Weinrib, "Corrective Justice in a Nutshell" (2002) 52:4 U Toronto L. J. at 349-352, 355-356.....326

Charles Larmore, "Public Reason" in Samuel Freeman, ed., *The Cambridge Companion to Rawls* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003) at 368-69, 370-71.....332

Questions IX.....334

E. Comparative Methodology

Ronald Dworkin, *Law's Empire* (Harvard University Press, 1986) at 65-68.....335

Stefan Vogenauer, "Sources of Law and Legal Method in Comparative Law" in Mathias Reimann and Reinhard Zimmermann, eds., *The Oxford Handbook of Comparative Law* 869 (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008) at 879-885, 886-889.....338

John C. Reitz, "How to Do Comparative Law" 46 Am. J. Comp. L. 617 (1998) at 617-636.....349

Catherine Valcke, "Reflections on Comparative Law Methodology" in Maurice Adams and Jacco Bomhoff, eds., *Doing Comparative Law* (forthcoming Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011) 369

Questions X.....396

V. Conclusion

Mathias M. Siems, "The End of Comparative Law" 2 J. of Comp. L. 133 (2007) at 133-150……397

Questions V……..……415